

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

REBUTTALS FOR INCREASING US BORDER SURVEILLANCE	2
INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (PRO) - SIMPLE.....	2
INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (PRO) - ADVANCED	2
PRO REBUTTAL VS. WASTING RESOURCES.....	3
<i>First... Technology is Improving.....</i>	3
<i>According to... the US Customs and Border Protection, January 11, 2024.....</i>	3
<i>Also... Preventing Economic Strain</i>	3
<i>According to... the Atlantic Council, September 27, 2022</i>	3
<i>Finally... Reducing Terrorism Risk</i>	3
<i>According to... the House Committee on Homeland Security, July 9, 2024</i>	3
PRO REBUTTAL VS. HARMING PEOPLE	4
<i>First... Regulations Protect Privacy.....</i>	4
<i>According to... the American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU), 2024.....</i>	4
<i>Also... Rescue Missions Save Lives</i>	4
<i>According to... U.S. Customs and Border Protection, July 5, 2024.....</i>	4
<i>Finally... Policies Against Discrimination</i>	4
<i>According to... the U.S. Government Accountability Office, January 11, 2024.....</i>	4
INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (CON) - SIMPLE	5
INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (CON) - ADVANCED	5
CON REBUTTAL VS. STRENGTHENING SECURITY	6
<i>First... Terrorism Risk is Exaggerated</i>	6
<i>According to... Sage Journals, August 11, 2021</i>	6
<i>Also... Surveillance is Unreliable.....</i>	6
<i>According to... the U.S. Government Accountability Office, July 24, 2013.....</i>	6
<i>Finally... Root Causes Remain Unaddressed.....</i>	6
<i>According to... the National Center for Biotechnology Information, March 1, 2017.....</i>	6
CON REBUTTAL VS. PROTECTING COMMUNITIES	7
<i>First... Surveillance Diverts Resources</i>	7
<i>According to... the American Immigration Council, August 14, 2024.....</i>	7
<i>Also... Surveillance is Tremendously Expensive.....</i>	7
<i>According to... MIT Technology Review, April 17, 2023</i>	7
<i>Finally... Immigrants Contribute to Communities.....</i>	7
<i>According to... the American Immigration Council, June 5, 2024.....</i>	7

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

REBUTTALS FOR INCREASING US BORDER SURVEILLANCE

INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (PRO) - SIMPLE

Hello, my name is... [Full Name].

In this speech, I will refute each of the opposing team's arguments.

The first argument I will refute is... Wasting Resources.

INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (PRO) - ADVANCED

Hello, my name is... [Full Name].

In this speech, I will refute each of the opposing team's arguments.

But first, let's discuss... "The Framework".

We think you should prefer our framework for two reasons:

1. *First*... Reasonability: Ours is a very reasonable interpretation.
2. *Also*... Fairness: Ours will not prevent either team from making relevant arguments.

So... Please use our framework and vote against teams who use their framework to disqualify relevant arguments - we think you should vote against the teams that do that!

Now, Let's discuss their first argument... Wasting Resources.

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

PRO REBUTTAL VS. WASTING RESOURCES

They said... increasing US border surveillance will Waste Resources.

We say... it will not Waste Resources.

Because...

First... Technology is Improving

According to... *the US Customs and Border Protection, January 11, 2024*

<https://www.cbp.gov/border-security/along-us-borders/us-border-patrol-technology>

It states... Advanced border surveillance technology has made significant progress recently. New systems detect unauthorized crossings more effectively, even in challenging weather conditions. This improvement means surveillance investments lead to more reliable border security.

This means... Updated border surveillance technology will save resources long-term by preventing illegal activities more efficiently and reducing the need for additional interventions.

Also... Preventing Economic Strain

According to... *the Atlantic Council, September 27, 2022*

<https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/in-depth-research-reports/report/the-economic-impact-of-a-more-efficient-us-mexico-border/>

It states... Illegal immigration can burden social services and contribute to job loss for American workers. Increasing border surveillance can reduce illegal immigration, protecting jobs and reducing strain on healthcare, education, and police services.

This means... Increased border surveillance will protect the economy by saving billions in social service costs and preserving jobs for American citizens.

Finally... Reducing Terrorism Risk

According to... *the House Committee on Homeland Security, July 9, 2024*

<https://homeland.house.gov/2024/07/09/chairmen-higgins-bishop-open-joint-hearing-border-security-technologies-play-a-critical-role-in-counteracting-threats-mass-illegal-immigration/#:~:text=For%20example%2C%20the%20deployment%20of,Border%20Patrol%20agents%20to%20cover>

It states... Terrorism is a serious concern. Even one successful attack can affect thousands, causing massive losses. Enhanced border surveillance helps catch potential threats before they enter the country, reducing attack likelihood.

This means... Investing in border surveillance is cost-effective and can prevent greater financial and social costs of terrorist attacks.

Therefore... increasing US border surveillance will NOT waste resources.

The next argument I will refute is... Harming People.

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

PRO REBUTTAL VS. HARMING PEOPLE

They said... increasing US border surveillance will Harm People.

We say... it will not Harm People.

Because...

First... Regulations Protect Privacy

According to... *the American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU), 2024*

<https://www.aclu.org/know-your-rights/border-zone#:~:text=The%20Fourth%20Amendment%20to%20the,immigration%20violations%20and%20federal%20crimes>

It states... Modern surveillance technology is designed with privacy protections. New systems use advanced algorithms to focus on suspicious activities and ignore irrelevant personal information, reducing privacy violation risks.

This means... Increased border surveillance will protect both security and privacy, minimizing harm to individuals while enhancing safety.

Also... Rescue Missions Save Lives

According to... *U.S. Customs and Border Protection, July 5, 2024*

<https://www.cbp.gov/frontline/cbp-makes-lifesaving-rescues>

It states... The U.S. Border Patrol's mission includes saving lives along the border. Agents are trained to rescue people in danger while crossing in unsafe environments, regardless of their reasons for crossing.

This means... Border patrol is prepared to help and save anyone taking risks when crossing the border, prioritizing life-saving efforts.

Finally... Policies Against Discrimination

According to... *the U.S. Government Accountability Office, January 11, 2024*

<https://www.gao.gov/products/gao-24-105383#:~:text=For%20example%2C%20consistent%20with%20the,but%20the%20most%20exceptional%20circumstances>

It states... While some misidentification occurs, especially for people with darker skin, the U.S. Customs and Border Protection has policies, guidance, and training to prevent and address discrimination in traveler inspection processes.

This means... Increasing border surveillance will help protect millions from being unfairly interrogated or punished based on race.

Therefore... increasing US border surveillance will NOT Harm People.

So, for all these reasons, please vote for the PRO. Thank you.

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (CON) - SIMPLE

Hello, my name is... [Full Name].

In this speech, I will refute each of the opposing team's arguments.

The first argument I will refute is... Wasting Resources.

INTRODUCTION FOR REBUTTALS (CON) - ADVANCED

Hello, my name is... [Full Name].

In this speech, I will refute each of the opposing team's arguments.

But first, let's discuss... "The Framework".

We think you should prefer our framework for two reasons:

1. *First*... Reasonability: Ours is a very reasonable interpretation.
2. *Also*... Fairness: Ours will not prevent either team from making relevant arguments.

So... Please use our framework and vote against teams who use their framework to disqualify relevant arguments - we think you should vote against the teams that do that!

Now, Let's discuss their first argument... Strengthening Security.

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

CON REBUTTAL VS. STRENGTHENING SECURITY

They said... increasing US border surveillance will Strengthen Security.

We say... it will not Strengthen Security.

Because...

First... Terrorism Risk is Exaggerated

According to... Sage Journals, August 11, 2021

<https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/research/the-cost-of-immigration-enforcement-and-border-security>

It states... The risk of harm from a terrorist attack is extremely low compared to everyday risks. The chance of dying in a bathtub accident is higher than being killed by a terrorist.

This means... Spending billions on border surveillance for a statistically unlikely threat does not improve safety; it wastes resources.

Also... Surveillance is Unreliable

According to... the U.S. Government Accountability Office, July 24, 2013

<https://www.gao.gov/products/gao-13-603#:~:text=These%20data%2D%2Dwhich%20are,methodologies%20used%20vary%20by%20crossing>

It states... Surveillance systems are effective only a small percentage of the time. Cameras cover only about 10% of the border, and bad weather or poor image quality can render them useless.

This means... These systems are too ineffective to justify their cost, leaving us no safer than before while wasting money.

Finally... Root Causes Remain Unaddressed

According to... the National Center for Biotechnology Information, March 1, 2017

<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pmc/articles/PMC5049707/>

It states... People cross the border due to deeper issues such as poverty and violence in their home countries. More surveillance won't solve these underlying problems.

This means... To enhance security effectively, we should focus on improving conditions in migrants' home countries rather than investing in ineffective surveillance.

Therefore... increasing US border surveillance will NOT Strengthen Security.

The next argument I will refute is... Protecting Communities.

Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Rebuttals

Topic: The US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

CON REBUTTAL VS. PROTECTING COMMUNITIES

They said... increasing US border surveillance will Protect Communities.

We say... it will not Protect Communities.

Because...

First... Surveillance Diverts Resources

According to... *the American Immigration Council, August 14, 2024*

<https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/research/the-cost-of-immigration-enforcement-and-border-security>

It states... Surveillance technology is extremely expensive and unreliable. The money spent on these systems could directly benefit communities through improved schools and hospitals.

This means... Rather than protecting communities, surveillance drains resources needed for community improvement.

Also... Surveillance is Tremendously Expensive

According to... *MIT Technology Review, April 17, 2023*

<https://www.technologyreview.com/2023/04/17/1071682/us-pouring-money-surveillance-towers-southern-border/>

It states... The cost of surveillance technology includes initial expenses, maintenance, updates, and training. Over time, this totals tens of billions of dollars that could address more pressing needs.

This means... Instead of helping communities, this spending wastes resources that could improve quality of life for everyone.

Finally... Immigrants Contribute to Communities

According to... *the American Immigration Council, June 5, 2024*

<https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/news/new-data-immigrants-driving-prosperity-in-united-states-2022#:~:text=Immigrants%20are%20filling%20critical%20jobs,country's%20construction%20industry%20are%20immigrants>

It states... Many immigrants, even if undocumented, pay taxes including sales and income taxes. These contributions support local economies and public services.

This means... Increasing border surveillance harms communities by targeting people who significantly contribute to the economy and society.

Therefore... increasing US border surveillance will NOT Protect Communities.

So, for all these reasons, please vote for the CON. Thank you.