

# Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Effectiveness (ver. 10-18.a)

Topic: US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

<b>BORDER SURVEILLANCE EFFECTIVENESS EVIDENCE (PRO)</b> .....	<b>2</b>
<b>EFFECTIVENESS (PRO)</b> .....	<b>2</b>
PRO: Successful Sponsor-Based Program .....	2
According to... Foreign Affairs October 17, 2024 .....	2
PRO: Technology-Aided Processing .....	2
According to... Foreign Affairs October 17, 2024 .....	2
PRO: Enhanced Detection Capabilities .....	2
According to... U.S. Customs and Border Protection, January 11, 2024 .....	2
PRO: Comprehensive Monitoring Systems.....	2
According to... U.S. Customs and Border Protection (accessed December 29, 2022) .....	2
PRO: Deterrent Effect.....	2
According to... Anduril Industries, September 16, 2021 .....	2
PRO: Complementary Security Measures .....	3
According to... U.S. Government Accountability Office, March 15, 2018 .....	3
PRO: Improved Identification Capabilities.....	3
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	3
<b>EFFECTIVENESS (CON)</b> .....	<b>4</b>
CON: Outdated Immigration System.....	4
According to... Foreign Affairs October 17, 2024 .....	4
CON: Reliance on Foreign Enforcement.....	4
According to... Foreign Affairs October 17, 2024 .....	4
CON: Insufficient Infrastructure.....	4
According to... Foreign Affairs October 17, 2024 .....	4
CON: Limited Operational Capacity .....	4
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	4
CON: Weather-Dependent Reliability .....	4
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	4
CON: High Cost, Low Efficiency .....	5
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	5
CON: Shifting Migration Routes.....	5
According to... TIME, May 21, 2024.....	5
CON: Limited Coverage Area .....	5
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	5
CON: Minimal Impact on Apprehensions .....	5
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	5
CON: Low Detection Rate.....	5
According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018 .....	5

## Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Effectiveness (ver. 10-18.a)

Topic: US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

### BORDER SURVEILLANCE EFFECTIVENESS EVIDENCE (PRO)

#### EFFECTIVENESS (PRO)

##### **PRO: Successful Sponsor-Based Program**

According to... *Foreign Affairs* October 17, 2024

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/united-states/immigration-mexico-border-crisis-andrea-flores>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will significantly reduce unauthorized crossings because new legal avenues for migrants from specific countries, requiring U.S.-based sponsors, have already decreased unauthorized border crossings from these countries by 99 percent.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be highly effective in managing hundreds of thousands of potential migrants because combining surveillance with alternative legal entry methods has shown remarkable success in reducing illegal border crossings.

##### **PRO: Technology-Aided Processing**

According to... *Foreign Affairs* October 17, 2024

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/united-states/immigration-mexico-border-crisis-andrea-flores>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will improve the orderliness of the asylum system because technologies like the CBP One app allow for more organized entry appointments and could potentially lead to more timely screenings by asylum officers.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be effective in managing tens of thousands of asylum seekers because it can utilize technology to create a more structured/efficient entry and screening process.

##### **PRO: Enhanced Detection Capabilities**

According to... *U.S. Customs and Border Protection*, January 11, 2024

<https://www.cbp.gov/border-security/along-us-borders/us-border-patrol-technology>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will significantly improve illegal crossing prevention because new systems can detect unauthorized crossings more effectively, even in challenging weather conditions and at night.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be highly effective in securing millions of Americans because these improved systems provide more reliable and comprehensive border protection, adapting to various environmental challenges.

##### **PRO: Comprehensive Monitoring Systems**

According to... *U.S. Customs and Border Protection* (accessed December 29, 2022)

[https://www.cbp.gov/sites/default/files/assets/documents/2017-Feb/FS\\_2017\\_TARS\\_FINAL.pdf](https://www.cbp.gov/sites/default/files/assets/documents/2017-Feb/FS_2017_TARS_FINAL.pdf)

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will improve situational awareness because unmanned aerostats stationed thousands of feet above key areas of the U.S.-Mexico border are equipped with downward-pointing radar systems with a 200-mile radius sensor capability.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be highly effective in monitoring large areas of the border because these advanced systems provide comprehensive, real-time information about activities across vast stretches of land, enabling quicker responses to potential threats.

##### **PRO: Deterrent Effect**

According to... *Anduril Industries*, September 16, 2021

<https://blog.anduril.com/president-biden-demanded-high-tech-capacity-for-border-security-805b7b5664b5>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will serve as a strong deterrent because potential border crossers are less likely to attempt illegal entry when they know they're being watched by advanced surveillance systems.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be effective in reducing illegal crossings for hundreds of thousands of potential migrants because the visible presence of technology discourages attempts to cross the border illegally.

## Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Effectiveness (ver. 10-18.a)

Topic: US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

### EFFECTIVENESS (PRO): CONTINUED...

#### **PRO: Complementary Security Measures**

According to... U.S. Government Accountability Office, March 15, 2018

<https://www.gao.gov/assets/gao-18-397t.pdf>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will enhance overall border security because it complements other measures such as the physical wall, which aims to delay potential border-crossers long enough for agents to arrive at the scene.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be effective as part of a comprehensive border security strategy because it works in tandem with physical barriers and human patrols to create a multi-layered approach to preventing illegal border crossings.

#### **PRO: Improved Identification Capabilities**

According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will enhance identification capabilities because Predator drone cameras can identify backpacks, vehicle types, and firearms from high altitudes, while smaller drones can identify people's ethnicity, height, weight, and hairstyle.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be effective in detecting and preventing illegal activities because it provides border agents with detailed information about potential threats, allowing for more targeted and efficient enforcement.

## Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Effectiveness (ver. 10-18.a)

Topic: US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

### EFFECTIVENESS (CON)

#### **CON: Outdated Immigration System**

According to... *Foreign Affairs* October 17, 2024

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/united-states/immigration-mexico-border-crisis-andrea-flores>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will fail to address the root causes of unauthorized migration because the current immigration system was designed for a different era and doesn't account for modern migration patterns and motivations.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be ineffective in managing millions of migrants because it relies on an outdated framework that doesn't address the fundamental reasons people are attempting to cross the border illegally.

#### **CON: Reliance on Foreign Enforcement**

According to... *Foreign Affairs* October 17, 2024

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/united-states/immigration-mexico-border-crisis-andrea-flores>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will struggle to maintain long-term effectiveness because it heavily relies on Mexico's ability to arrest and detain migrants, which is unsustainable due to Mexico's limited capacity to deport them.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will fail to consistently manage the flow of hundreds of thousands of migrants because its success depends on the uncertain and limited capabilities of foreign governments rather than robust US infrastructure and policies.

#### **CON: Insufficient Infrastructure**

According to... *Foreign Affairs* October 17, 2024

<https://www.foreignaffairs.com/united-states/immigration-mexico-border-crisis-andrea-flores>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will face significant challenges because the current border infrastructure is not equipped to handle the volume and diversity of migrants attempting to enter the country.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will struggle to effectively process millions of migrants because the existing facilities and systems are inadequate for the scale and complexity of modern migration patterns.

#### **CON: Limited Operational Capacity**

According to... *CATO Institute*, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will face significant operational constraints because CBP's Predator drones were airborne only 6.4 percent of available hours per year from 2013 to 2016, averaging just 1 hour and 35 minutes per day.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be ineffective in providing consistent coverage because aerial surveillance tools spend very little time in operation, leaving large gaps in monitoring.

#### **CON: Weather-Dependent Reliability**

According to... *CATO Institute*, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will struggle with consistency because CBP managed to conduct only 69 percent of its scheduled drone launches in 2016, with 20 percent canceled due to weather alone.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will fail to provide reliable monitoring because environmental conditions frequently prevent operations, creating opportunities for undetected border crossings.

## Forensics Team (Fall 2024) – Effectiveness (ver. 10-18.a)

Topic: US government should substantially expand its surveillance infrastructure along its southern border.

### EFFECTIVENESS (PRO): CONTINUED...

#### **CON: High Cost, Low Efficiency**

According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will be financially burdensome because each Predator B drone costs \$17 million to purchase and \$12,255 per flight hour to operate, yet they have led to only 0.5 percent of apprehensions at a cost of \$32,000 per arrest.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be an inefficient use of resources because the high costs associated with these technologies do not correspond to a proportional increase in successful apprehensions or deterrence of illegal border crossings.

#### **CON: Shifting Migration Routes**

According to... TIME, May 21, 2024

<https://time.com/6979557/unregulated-border-technology-migration-essay/>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will not deter determined migrants because people desperate for safety will not stop coming, but instead use more circuitous and dangerous routes, leading to a threefold increase in deaths at the U.S.-Mexico frontier.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be ineffective in reducing overall migration and may cause harm because it forces migrants to take more dangerous paths, potentially resulting in more injuries and fatalities rather than deterring migration attempts.

#### **CON: Limited Coverage Area**

According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will have restricted reach because drones regularly patrolled only about 170 miles of the 2,000-mile southern land border in 2013, due to flight restrictions and other limitations.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be ineffective in monitoring vast stretches of the border because current technologies have significant limitations in their ability to cover the entire border region, leaving large areas vulnerable to unauthorized crossings.

#### **CON: Minimal Impact on Apprehensions**

According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will have minimal impact on illegal crossings because from 2013 to 2016, the U.S. Border Patrol attributed fewer than 8,000 of its 1.7 million apprehensions to drones.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will be ineffective in significantly enhancing border security because aerial surveillance contributes to only a tiny fraction of overall apprehensions.

#### **CON: Low Detection Rate**

According to... CATO Institute, May 1, 2018

<https://www.cato.org/immigration-research-policy-brief/drones-border-efficacy-privacy-implications>

It states... Increasing US border surveillance will have limited detection capabilities because drones detected only 21,384 suspected border crossers from 2014 to 2016, which may have been at most 1.2 percent of total illegal border crossings.

This means... Increasing US border surveillance will fail to detect the vast majority of illegal border crossings because current technologies are only able to identify a small percentage of those attempting to cross the border.