NSDA Public Forum Debate (Nov-Dec 2023)
Topic: Student Loan Forgiveness

PROS & CONS OF STUDENT LOAN FORGIVENESS (REBUTTALS)

INTRODUCTION (Second Speakers)

[Rebuttal Speech: 4 min]

Hello, my name is… _____ .

In this speech, I will **refute** each of my opponent's arguments.

Optional: But first, let's discuss the framework.

The first argument I will **refute** is… _____ .

[Final Focus Speech: 2 min]

In this speech, I will **present** each of my team's voting issues.

Optional: But first, let's discuss the framework.

"We think the most important argument is… _____ .

THE FRAMEWORK (Both Sides)

[Keywords]
According to... Investopedia, September 21, 2023
"Student debt is money borrowed by individuals to cover the cost of education."
_So..._ student debt 'forgiveness' would mean not having to repay the loan.

[Value]
Our value is… **Quality of life.**

[Criteria]
Our criteria is… **On balance.**

"So, the side that "on balance" provides the most Quality of Life for the most people should win the debate."

Topic: Student Loan Forgiveness

[PRO] AT: Lacking Effectiveness

They said… Student Loan Forgiveness will be ineffective.

We say… Student Loan Forgiveness will NOT be ineffective.

Because...

First… Strong Public Support for Regulation

S: *According to...* Carolyn Fast, Director, Higher Education Policy, The Century Foundation, July 26, 2023
https://tcf.org/content/commentary/college-tuition-is-out-of-control-voters-want-government-to-do-something/
Note: Carolyn Fast, Director, Higher Education Policy (Undergraduate: Harvard, Law Degree: Columbia). Our research shows strong support for a government role in making tuition more affordable—a two-thirds majority of voters agreed that the government should do more to rein in prices (see Figure 3). Support for government intervention is strong across party lines. There is also strong agreement that the government has even more responsibility to regulate the price of tuition for schools that receive federal financial aid.
F: *It states...* Current research shows a strong public support for government to regulate the price of tuition.
C: *This means...* student loan forgiveness together with regulation can make a tremendous difference in people's lives. Forgiveness can help the people while the government takes action to regulate the colleges.

Also… Rulemaking is Non-Binding (& Time-Consuming)

S: *According to...* Forbes Magazine, July 17, 2023
https://www.forbes.com/sites/alisongriffin/2023/07/17/negotiated-rulemaking-is-one-path-to-student-loan-forgiveness-heres-how-it-works/
F: *It states...* Currently, the focus is on the Department of Education's negotiated rulemaking process. Even if the negotiated rulemaking committee reaches consensus, the decision is not binding and it will take time to gather, to review the issues, and come to consensus (or not), and submit a report back to the government.
C: *This means...* The SAVE Act and the rulemaking approaches are too time-consuming; people are suffering now and shouldn't have to wait months or even years (ex. ten years) to have their debt cancelled.

Furthermore… Serious Reduction in Living Standards

S: *According to...* the Washington Post, June 25, 2019
https://www.washingtonpost.com/business/2019/06/25/heres-what-trillion-student-loan-debt-is-doing-us-economy/
F: *It states...* Years of research show that post-college debt forces people to put off starting a family, buying a home, or even starting a business. Student loans prevented 400,00 families from buying a home, it also prevented people from having the money to start a business or even get married and start a family.
C: *This means...* student loan debt is directly responsible for millions of people to put off a better quality of life because their debt is too high, and this prevents them from making a better for themselves.

Finally…

S: *According to...* _____

F: *It states...* _____

_____

C: *This means...* _____

_____

Therefore… Student Loan Forgiveness will <u>NOT</u> be ineffective.

"Our next argument I will refute is…"

[or] *"So, for all these reasons, please vote for the PRO. Thank you."*

[PRO] AT: Wasting Money (or Trade-Offs: Harming Social Programs)

They said… Student Loan Forgiveness will waste money (or harm social programs).

We say… Student Loan Forgiveness will NOT waste money (or harm social programs).

Because...

First… Preventing Economic Threats

S: *According to...* Forbes Magazine, October 31, 2023
https://www.forbes.com/sites/forbesfinancecouncil/2023/10/31/student-loan-payments-are-back-the-domino-effect-on-the-us-economy/
F: *It states...* The U.S. is preparing for a sizeable reduction in consumer spending. According to economists, the repayment of student loans will result cause a monthly reduction in spending of up to $9 billion, or over $100 billion annually. This increases the risk of a recession or could end up stalling our economic recovery.
C: *This means...* eliminating student loan debt can reduce the suffering of tens of millions of people by preventing "sizeable" economic harm to the economy and reducing their debt burdens.

Also… Debt Relief Boosts the Economy

S: *According to...* Roosevelt Institute, January 2021
https://rooseveltinstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/RI_UnburdenedCancellingStudentDebt_FactSheet_202101.pdf
F: *It states...* With skyrocketing tuition and shrinking economic opportunities for young graduates, student debt is a strain our fragile economy cannot afford. We must act quickly to cancel student debt. Doing so would not only offer immediate relief to borrowers but provide a much-needed boost to the economy.
C: *This means...* when people spend the money instead of repaying it to the government, it will boost economic growth improving the lives of millions of people.

Furthermore… $108 Billion Dollar Boost to GDP

S: *According to...* Roosevelt Institute, January 2021
https://rooseveltinstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/RI_UnburdenedCancellingStudentDebt_FactSheet_202101.pdf
F: *It states...* Freeing up funds through debt cancellation would allow millions of borrowers to spend more in the economy. This can increase our GDP by up to $108 billion over the next ten years.
C: *This means...* cancelling student debt will stimulate the economy for everyone's benefit making hundreds of millions of people better off with more opportunities to improve their quality of life.

Finally…

S: *According to...* _____

F: *It states...* _____

_____

C: *This means...* _____

_____

Therefore… Student Loan Forgiveness will <u>NOT</u> waste money (or harm social programs).

"Our next argument I will refute is…"

[or] *"So, for all these reasons, please vote for the PRO. Thank you."*

[CON] AT: Reducing Financial Burdens

They said… Student Loan Forgiveness will help reduce financial burdens.

We say… This will NOT help reduce financial burdens.

Because...

First… Current Programs are Enough (ex. SAVE Plan)

S: *According to… CNBC News, August 31, 2023*
https://www.cnbc.com/2023/08/31/save-student-debt-repayment-plan-pros-and-cons.html
F: *It states...* for low-income families, the current loan program will not exceed 10% of their discretionary income. Meaning if they are at or slightly above poverty then their payments will be reduced to zero.
C: *This means...* without a monthly payment they won't need forgiveness to provide for their family. After ten years, the loan can be forgiven. So, targeted repayment is better than forgiving all debt to everyone.

Also… Forgiveness Ignores the "Root" Causes

S: *According to... the Brookings Institution, August 25, 2022*
https://www.brookings.edu/articles/bidens-student-debt-cancellation-doesnt-solve-the-root-problems-facing-borrowers-but-its-a-start/
F: *It states...* cancelling loan repayment will not address the root of the problem, which is the 300% increase in tuition over the last 30 years - by not changing the system, we are putting future borrowers at risk.
C: *This means...* we will spend more than a trillion dollars on a program that does nothing to address the cause of these problems. This could invite a repeat of even higher costs and even more borrowing.

Furthermore… Making Existing Problems Worse

S: *According to… Dr. Vance Ginn, Economist, Library of Economics and Liberty, October 20, 2023*
https://www.econlib.org/bidens-student-loan-forgiveness-plan-makes-the-poor-pay-for-the-rich/
While the intention behind President Biden's <u>student loan forgiveness may appear noble</u> (in likelihood, it is a rent-seeking move), <u>the results may prove detrimental to our nation's economic stability and fairness</u>. And if the debt is monetized, <u>more inflation will result</u>. <u>Forgiving student loans will exacerbate existing problems, with the brunt of the burden falling on lower-income Americans. Instead of improving the situation, it will likely create an intricate web of financial consequences, indirectly affecting the very people it aims to help.</u> But that is the result of most government programs with good intentions.
F: *It states…* forgiveness harms our economy and reduces fairness because it causes inflation to rise, which will make existing problems even worse. So instead of improving the situation it ends up harming the very people it tried to help.
C: *This means…* student loan forgiveness will cause tens of millions of people to suffer. Instead of making life better for low-income families, minorities, and women it will instead harm the economy and ultimately make their lives even worse.

Finally…

S: *According to...* _____

F: *It states...* _____

_____

C: *This means...* _____

_____

Therefore… Student Loan Forgiveness will <u>NOT</u> help to reduce financial burdens.

"Our next argument I will refute is…"

[or] *"So, for all these reasons, please vote for the PRO. Thank you."*

[CON] AT: Improving the Economy

They said… Student Loan Forgiveness will help boost the economy.

We say… Student Loan Forgiveness will NOT help the economy.

Because...

First… Assumptions of Economic Growth are Unreliable
S: According to... the Texas Public Policy Foundation, May 4, 2022
https://www.texaspolicy.com/the-economic-problems-with-student-loan-forgiveness/
In summary, the notion that student loan forgiveness would stimulate the economy is incorrect. While some forgiveness advocates argue the multiplier is 1.5, this result relies on questionable simulations and bizarre assumptions (such as ignoring the Fed's response) that artificially inflate the multiplier. The actual multiplier is likely to be close to zero or even negative.
F: *It states...* The idea that student loan forgiveness would stimulate the economy is incorrect because it relies on questionable simulations and assumptions. The actual multiplier is close to zero or even negative.
C: *This means…* any evidence assuming economic growth is invalid due to severe flaws in the calculations.

Also… Government Income is Severely Reduced
S: According to… Slate Magazine, March 24, 2021.
https://slate.com/business/2021/03/student-loan-total-annual-government-payments.html
F: *It states…* each year the government collects around 70 billion dollars from student loan repayments of which 20 billion dollars is the interest.
C: *This means…* forgiving student loan debt will cost citizens tens of billions of dollars per year for a very long time, compared to a short-term gain, which at most will only last a few years.

Furthermore…

S: *According to...* _____

F: *It states...* _____

_____

C: *This means...* _____

_____

Finally…

S: *According to...* _____

F: *It states...* _____

_____

C: *This means...* _____

_____

Therefore… Student Loan Forgiveness will <u>NOT</u> help the economy.

"Our next argument I will refute is…"

[or] *"So, for all these reasons, please vote for the CON. Thank you."*